Mapping Hard to Count Communities with HTC 2020 for a Fair and Accurate Census

Steven Romalewski

Center for Urban Research at the Graduate Center, City University of New York (CUNY)

New York Counts 2020 State Convening
January 15, 2020
Some HTC mapping & data resources

Census 2020 HTC 2020 map
- [www.censushardtountmaps2020.us](http://www.censushardtountmaps2020.us)
  - Flexible; includes information for stakeholders that may not be part of official Census Bureau resources
  - Comprehensive; multiple sources of data & interactive features within single mapping website

Census Bureau ROAM map
- [https://census.gov/roam](https://census.gov/roam)
  - Official Census Bureau site
  - Focused on predictive Low Response Score
  - Packs in a lot of census data

New York State Rockefeller Institute
- [2020 Census Regional Undercount Risks](https://census.gov/roam)
  - Regional perspective on comparative census challenges across New York State
Hard-to-Count Maps across the US

Local, state, and federal agencies & other organizations have developed mapping websites to help census supporters prioritize their work around a fair and accurate 2020 Census. This is a list-in-progress; please contact us if we're missing any maps or if we should update the information below.

NATIONWIDE

- CUNY Graduate Center Census 2020 Hard to Count map
- U.S. Census Bureau
  - Response Outreach Area Mapper (ROAM)
  - Census Engagement Navigator
  - Type of Enumeration Area (TEA) Viewer
  - In-Field Address Canvassing (IFAC) Viewer
- Policy Map
  - 2010 Mail Return Rates
  - Low Response Scores
  - 2013-2017 American Community Survey self-response rates
- Social Explorer

ALABAMA

- Interactive Census Low Response Score By Census Tract
- PDF version Census Low Response Score By Census Tract

ARIZONA

- City of Tempe, AZ Census 2020 Dashboard

ARKANSAS
Every 10 years, here’s how the Census Bureau counts us:

1. Self-Response
   - Census Bureau mails information about the decennial questionnaire to almost all households (starting in March 2020, continuing through April).
   - For 2020, some households will be mailed the actual questionnaire, most households will be mailed a website link to fill out the form online, & everyone will have the opportunity to mail in the form or call-in their responses.
   
   *The most accurate & complete population data is submitted during this phase.*

2. Non-Response Follow Up
   - The Census Bureau hires 100s of thousands of people to go door-to-door to count every household that didn’t self-respond (after April 1, 2020).
   - Much more expensive than the self-response phase ($2 BILLION in 2010).
   - *During this phase, the risk is greatest that people will be missed or counted inaccurately.*
   - Areas with large shares of households that don’t self-respond are therefore “hard to count”. Almost every community will have some households that don’t self-respond. But in many communities **25% or more of their households** didn’t mail in their forms and needed to be counted in person. *We’ve mapped these communities to help ensure a fair and accurate 2020 Census.*
Hard to count factors

- 2010 mail return rate
- Low response score
- 2020-specific issues: internet access; concerns about citizenship
- Recent population characteristics
Hard-to-count factors

• **2010 mail return rate:** definitive count of households that self-responded in last census; low MRR means many households had to be counted in-person

• **Low response score:** uses some recent and some older (2010) population data to predict areas where large share of households will not self-respond.

• **Updated concerns in 2020:** lack of home internet access (and potential for libraries to help by providing wifi access).
  — Census Bureau contact strategies that may help overcome internet access: “Internet Choice” as well as “Internet First” mailings

• **Recent population estimates:** populations at risk of being undercounted for various reasons.
Will this tract be hard-to-count in 2020? (2010 mail return rate; recently added LRS)
Hard-to-count factors

• **2010 mail return rate**: definitive count of households that self-responded in last census; low MRR means many households had to be counted in-person

• **Low response score**: uses some recent and some older (2010) population data to predict areas where large share of households will not self-respond.

• **Updated concerns in 2020**: lack of home internet access (and potential for libraries to help by providing wifi access).
  – Census Bureau contact strategies that may help overcome internet access: “Internet Choice” as well as “Internet First” mailings

• **Recent population estimates**: populations at risk of being undercounted for various reasons.
Internet access? (2020 Census will be digital)

Blue crosshatching: tracts with X% households that have no home internet
Hard-to-count factors

- **2010 mail return rate:** definitive count of households that self-responded in last census; low MRR means many households had to be counted in-person

- **Low response score:** uses some recent and some older (2010) population data to predict areas where large share of households will not self-respond.

- **Updated concerns in 2020:** lack of home internet access (and potential for libraries to help by providing wifi access).
  - Census Bureau contact strategies that may help overcome internet access: “Internet Choice” as well as “Internet First” mailings

- **Recent population estimates:** populations at risk of being undercounted for various reasons.
For households receiving a mailing:

The Census Bureau will mail an invitation letter to 95.8% (or 855) of the tract's housing units.

The mailing for households in this tract is called *Internet Choice* because it will include a paper version of the census questionnaire, as well as online instructions and a unique ID for online response.

Also, the paper questionnaire and online instructions will be bilingual in Spanish & English, because at least 20 percent of this tract's households are recognized as needing "Spanish assistance" — defined as at least one household member aged 15 or older who speaks Spanish and does not speak English "very well" based on the 2013–2017 American Community Survey (ACS).

The paper form will be included because the latest American Community Survey (ACS) shows that this tract had a low self-response rate and either a higher population of people age 65 or more, low internet subscribership rates, or low internet response during the latest ACS.

The packet also will include a Language Assistance insert with instructions in English plus 12 other languages for calling a phone assistance line with questions or to provide your responses right over the phone.

If your household does not respond initially by mailing back a completed census form, or online or by phone, the Census Bureau will send you two reminder mailings.
Hard-to-count factors

- **2010 mail return rate:** definitive count of households that self-responded in last census; low MRR means many households had to be counted in-person

- **Low response score:** uses some recent and some older (2010) population data to predict areas where large share of households will not self-respond.

- **Updated concerns in 2020:** lack of home internet access (and potential for libraries to help by providing wifi access).
  - Census Bureau contact strategies that may help overcome internet access: “Internet Choice” as well as “Internet First” mailings

- **Recent population estimates:** populations at risk of being undercounted for various reasons.
The Census Bureau will invite households in Tract 30 to participate in the 2020 Census by:
- Mailing a letter to 95.8% of the tract's housing units, beginning March 2020.
- Hand-delivering a census packet to 4.2% of the tract's housing units, beginning March 2020.

Click/tap below for more info on factors affecting Tract 30’s participation in the 2020 Census:

Populations at Risk of Being Undercounted
Some populations historically have been, or are at risk of being, missed in the census at disproportionately high rates. These include (based on 2013-17 estimates):

- ~11% of the tract's population are children under 5.

Note: Analysis of recent decennial census results shows that young children are undercounted in the census at a higher rate than any other age group. [PDF]

Populations at Risk of Being Undercounted

Some populations historically have been, or are at risk of being, missed in the census at disproportionately high rates. These include (based on 2013-17 estimates):

- ~92% of the tract’s households are renter occupied (an estimated 689 households).
- By comparison, ~8% of the tract’s households are owner occupied (an estimated 59 households).

Note: According to the latest Census Bureau research on census self-response [PDF], “renters are much less likely to mail back a census questionnaire than homeowners.”

Populations at Risk of Being Undercounted

Some populations historically have been, or are at risk of being, missed in the census at disproportionately high rates. These include (based on 2013-17 estimates):

- ~57% of the tract is in poverty (an estimated 1,120 people have incomes below the poverty level).
- Another 27% of the population is near poverty (an estimated 531 people have incomes between 100 and 200% of the poverty level).

NB: These statistics apply to the population for whom poverty status has been determined.

Note: see Will You Count? Households with Low Incomes in the 2020 Census [PDF].

Putting it all together

Advanced Tract Search
• Select all tracts within a county based on any of the population and housing data at the HTC map
• Show those selected tracts on the map and download the data just for those tracts.

Examples:
• Tracts in Onondaga County where kids under 5 make up 10% or more of the population.
• Tracts in Onondaga where the black population is greater than 30% -- and -- 25% or more households have no home internet subscription.
The Census Bureau will invite households in Tract 42 to participate in the 2020 Census by:
- Mailing a letter to 100% of the tract’s housing units, beginning March 2020.

Click/tap below for more info on factors affecting Tract 42’s participation in the 2020 Census:

Populations at Risk of Being Undercounted

Some populations historically have been, or are at risk of being, missed in the census at disproportionately high rates. These include (based on 2013-17 estimates):

- ~21% of the tract is Hispanic (regardless of race)
- ~78% of the tract reported their race as Black (either alone or in combination with other races)

(Percentages may not total 100%.)

Note: see the Census Bureau’s analysis of net undercount rates for race and Hispanic origin categories, DSSD 2010 CENSUS COVERAGE MEASUREMENT MEMORANDUM SERIES #2010-G-01. [PDF]

Download the data
Using the HTC 2020 map & data to prioritize Get Out the Count outreach strategies

Low mail return rates in 2010
- Emphasize importance of self-response

People of color
- Political representation, historic undercounts

Limited internet connectivity
- Nearby public libraries?

Recent immigrants
- Emphasize importance of self-response (no need to talk with Census enumerator)
- Importance of being counted despite worrisome political climate

Young children
- 2.2 million missed nationwide in 2010 census

Trusted voices / trusted partners!
Going beyond the online map:

• **Download Excel list of tracts with detailed population estimates** from the latest American Community Survey – state-by-state or nationwide.

• **Compare tract data to a PDF map of your county/borough** with tracts labeled on the map.

• **Link the Excel data to a shapefile of tracts** for additional spatial analysis & outreach planning.

• **Print your map** – zoom to any location on the map and create a printable version – send directly to your printer or save as a PDF.

• **Share your map** – zoom to any location on the map and create a shareable and embeddable link specific to that view of the map.
Download Excel list of tracts with detailed population estimates

Downloadable files for Colorado (data for Denver County is included in these files):
- Tract data [Excel]
- Tract map [shapefile]
- Map of Denver County; tracts on this PDF map are labeled by ID so you can compare with the Excel tract list

Based on the latest census estimates (for the 2013-2017 period):

Data Downloads
Below are links to the tract-level data that we use for the Hard to Count map, as well as links to statewide tract shapefiles (via the Census Bureau) in case you want to map the tract data.

Each Excel file includes the 2010 Census mail return rate, the latest demographic estimates for populations at risk of being undercounted, and internet access estimates for each tract.

Each file has two worksheets:
1. one with the data,
2. the other with a description of the columns/fields. This second worksheet (called Fieldnames) also includes source information for the data.

The tract data is compiled from two Census Bureau sources: the Bureau's Planning Database (which provides the 2010 mail return rates); and the 2013-2017 American Community Survey estimates (via American FactFinder). Please let us know if you have any questions and/or feedback about the data, field names, source information, etc.

Nationwide tract Excel file (30 MB)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>State</th>
<th>Tract data</th>
<th>Shapefile</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Alabama</td>
<td>AL Excel file</td>
<td>AL shapefile</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Alaska</td>
<td>AK Excel file</td>
<td>AK shapefile</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Arizona</td>
<td>AZ Excel file</td>
<td>AZ shapefile</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Arkansas</td>
<td>AR Excel file</td>
<td>AR shapefile</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Compare tract data to a PDF map of your county
Detailed descriptions & data sources – helping to make the data intuitive

<p>| | | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>A</td>
<td>B</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Variable</td>
<td>Label</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GEOID</td>
<td>Combined State County Tract FIPS code</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GEOIDtxt</td>
<td>Combined State County Tract FIPS code as text</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>State</td>
<td>State FIPS code</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Stusps10</td>
<td>State abbreviation</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>State_name</td>
<td>State name</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>County10</td>
<td>County FIPS code</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>County_name10</td>
<td>County name</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tract10</td>
<td>Tract code that matches map tract labels</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MRR2010</td>
<td>2010 mail return rate (a value of &quot;99999&quot; means no mail return rate was recorded for this tract)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MRR20pcpthreshold</td>
<td>1 if 2010 MRR was 73% or less - i.e. hard to count (0 if above 73%)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UE_flag</td>
<td>1 if tract was included in update/enumerate component of 2010 census - i.e. hard to count</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HTCcomboflag</td>
<td>1 if tract was hard-to-count based on either 2010 MRR or update/enumerate</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TotPopACS17</td>
<td>2013-2017 ACS total population estimate</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TotPopinHHS</td>
<td>Population in households ACS 2013-17 table B25008</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GroupQuarterACS17</td>
<td>Population in group quarters ACS 2013-17 table B26001</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TotUnder5</td>
<td>Population age 0-4 ACS 2013-2017 table B01001</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hispanic</td>
<td>Hispanic population ACS 2013-2017 table B03002</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BlackAloneOrCombo</td>
<td>Black or African American alone or in combination with one or more other races ACS 2013-2017 table B02009</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AmerIndAloneorCom</td>
<td>People who are American Indian or Alaska Native alone or in combination with one or more other races ACS 2013-2017 table B02011</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AsianAloneOrCombo</td>
<td>Asian alone or in combination with one or more other races ACS 2013-2017 table B02011</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NatHawAloneOrCom</td>
<td>Native Hawaiian and Other Pacific Islander alone or in combination with one or more other races ACS 2013-2017 table B02012</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WhiteAloneOrCom</td>
<td>White alone or in combination with one or more other races ACS 2013-2017 table B02009</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FB2010Plus</td>
<td>Foreign-born entering 2010 or later ACS 2013-2017 table B05005</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FBNNotCit2010Plus</td>
<td>Foreign-born non-citizen entering 2010 or later ACS 2013-2017 table B05005</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

TOTAL POPULATION CHARACTERISTICS

FOREIGN BORN POPULATION

HOUSEHOLD CHARACTERISTICS
www.CensusHardToCountMaps2020.us

Updates as we get closer to the 2020 count
Data that will be available in Spring 2020

• Self-response rates from the Census Bureau that will show:
  ➢ day-to-day self-response rates
    o combined internet, paper, and phone/CQA;
  ➢ separate rates just for internet self-response; and
  ➢ comparable 2010 rates:
    o overall rate from end of 2010 self-response operation.

• Published daily by the Bureau (starting March 20) via:
  ➢ Census Bureau API (link TBD)
  ➢ Downloadable file from Census Bureau (comma-delimited)
  ➢ Online map from Census Bureau (TBD)
  ➢ Hard-to-Count map (www.censushardtocountmaps2020.us)
  ➢ Other maps from state/local stakeholders?
Rates will be published for these areas:

1. National (includes 50 states and District of Columbia only)
2. State (50 states, District of Columbia, and Puerto Rico)
3. County
4. Census Tract
5. County Subdivision
6. Tribal Census Tract
7. Indian Reservation (including Off Reservation Trust Land)
8. Consolidated Cities
9. Incorporated Places
10. Congressional Districts
11. Region (West, Midwest, South, and Northeast)

Importantly, at this point the Bureau doesn’t plan to publish rates for:

• areas smaller than census tracts
• state legislative districts
• unincorporated places/villages
Example of highlighting “participation rates” on 2010 HTC map
Other resources (a partial list)

Census Counts 2020 (via Leadership Conference on Civil and Human Rights)
  • [https://censuscounts.org/](https://censuscounts.org/)
    ➢ Fact sheets and state/city/congress district tables of HTC pop.
    ➢ White papers on citizenship question, privacy concerns, health care implications of census, and much more

The Census Project
  • [https://thecensusproject.org/](https://thecensusproject.org/)

Counting For Dollars
  • [http://civilrightsdocs.info/pdf/census/CountingForDollars-Intro.pdf](http://civilrightsdocs.info/pdf/census/CountingForDollars-Intro.pdf)
    ➢ Analysis of federal/state funding dependent on accurate census data
Contact for questions, additional information:


Steven Romalewski

Center for Urban Research at the Graduate Center, CUNY

212-817-2033

sromalewski@gc.cuny.edu